

FY 2014

\$79,056 to the City of Redlands, CA, to promote Redlands' farmers' markets through enhanced services, marketing campaigns and promotions, and vendor trainings.

Final Report

**Farmers Market Promotion Program (FMPP)
Final Performance Report**

The final performance report summarizes the outcome of your FMPP award objectives. As stated in the FMPP Terms and Conditions, you will not be eligible for future FMPP or Local Food Promotion Program grant funding unless all close-out procedures are completed, including satisfactory submission of this final performance report.

This final report will be made available to the public once it is approved by FMPP staff. Write the report in a way that promotes your project's accomplishments, as this document will serve as not only a learning tool, but a promotional tool to support local and regional food programs. Particularly, recipients are expected to provide both qualitative and quantitative results to convey the activities and accomplishments of the work.

The report is limited to 10 pages and is due **within 90 days** of the project's performance period end date, or sooner if the project is complete. Provide answers to each question, or answer "not applicable" where necessary. It is recommended that you email or fax your completed performance report to FMPP staff to avoid delays:

FMPP Phone: 202-690-4152; Email: USDAFMPPQuestions@ams.usda.gov; Fax: 202-690-4152

Should you need to mail your documents via hard copy, contact FMPP staff to obtain mailing instructions.

Report Date Range: <i>(e.g. September 30, 20XX-September 29, 20XX)</i>	September 30, 2014 to September 29, 2016
Authorized Representative Name:	N. Enrique Martinez
Authorized Representative Phone:	909-798-7510
Authorized Representative Email:	nemartinez@cityofredlands.org
Recipient Organization Name:	City of Redlands
Project Title as Stated on Grant Agreement:	Growing the Redlands Farmers' Markets Project
Grant Agreement Number: <i>(e.g. 14-FMPPX-XX-XXXX)</i>	14-FMPPX-CA-0012
Year Grant was Awarded:	2014
Project City/State:	Redlands, California
Total Awarded Budget:	\$79,056

FMPP staff may contact you to follow up for long-term success stories. Who may we contact?

- Same Authorized Representative listed above (check if applicable).
- Different individual: Name: Janet Miller, Project Manager II; Email: jamiller@cityofredlands.org; Phone: 909-335-4755 x9

According to the Paperwork Reduction Act of 1995, an agency may not conduct or sponsor, and a person is not required to respond to a collection of information unless it displays a valid OMB control number. The valid OMB control number for this information collection is 0581-0287. The time required to complete this information collection is estimated to average 4 hours per response, including the time for reviewing instructions, searching existing data sources, gathering and maintaining the data needed, and completing and reviewing the collection of information. The U.S. Department of Agriculture (USDA) prohibits discrimination in all its programs and activities on the basis of race, color, national origin, age, disability, and where applicable sex, marital status, or familial status, parental status religion, sexual orientation, genetic information, political beliefs, reprisal, or because all or part of an individual's income is derived from any public assistance program (not all prohibited bases apply to all programs). Persons with disabilities who require alternative means for communication of program information (Braille, large print, audiotape, etc.) should contact USDA's TARGET Center at (202) 720-2600 (voice and TDD). To file a complaint of discrimination, write USDA, Director, Office of Civil Rights, 1400 Independence Avenue, SW, Washington, DC 20250-9410 or call (800) 795-3272 (voice) or (202) 720-6382 (TDD). USDA is an equal opportunity provider and employer.

1. State the goals/objectives of your project as outlined in the grant narrative and/or approved by FMPP staff. If the goals/objectives from the narrative have changed from the grant narrative, please highlight those changes (e.g. “new objective”, “new contact”, “new consultant”, etc.). You may add additional goals/objectives if necessary. For each item below, qualitatively discuss the progress made and indicate the impact on the community, if any.

i. **Goal/Objective 1:** Develop and implement a comprehensive marketing and advertising strategy; encourage healthier eating patterns by consumers; increase shopper visitor counts and; increase farmers sales at the farmers’ markets.

a. Progress Made: The City vigorously pursued all 15 Activities outlined in Goal/Objective 1 during the term of the grant. One of the most notable successes was the development and implementation of a social media marketing strategy. During the term of the grant the City’s farmers’ markets went from almost no social media presence other than an outdated website to having 3,976 Facebook, 933 Instagram and 488 Twitter followers. This presence allows the City to continue to share information about the markets, benefits, upcoming events, and healthy living tips with the community in a very cost-effective manner.

b. Impact on Community: The City was able to provide improved access to locally produced agricultural products to the local community which resulted in increased consumption of healthier food choices. These increases also translated to increased farmers sales.

ii. **Goal/Objective 2:** Increase SNAP/EBT recipients participation at the farmers’ markets and reduce access to barriers to affordable, nutritious, and locally grown food, and to encourage customer diversity at the existing farmers’ markets.

a. Progress Made: As a direct result of receiving the FMPP grant, the City was able to hire a Part-Time Market Assistant which enabled us to implement SNAP/EBT acceptance at the Thursday Night Farmers’ Market.

b. Impact on Community: SNAP/EBT sales went from \$19 per night to an average of \$24 per market during the term of the grant. This added feature to the Thursday night farmers’ market has been very well received by the previously under-served low- to moderate- income population from not only our Redlands residents, but from residents of several surrounding communities as well.

iii. **Goal/Objective 3:** Develop and implement education programs designed to strengthen and improve the existing markets by providing advanced training and technical assistance to local farmers and market management staff.

a. Progress Made: A variety of farmer and market staff education opportunities were explored during the term of the grant. A Social Media Workshop that was attended by six market participants was held, and while it was well received by the attendees, it was determined that continued attempts to facilitate further training opportunities should not be pursued. Reasons included a lack of time,

taking away from their farming obligations or time spent at other markets selling. There also a slight digital divide due to age and language barriers with some farmers.

b. Impact on Community: Market staff benefited from the training and education opportunities, particularly on the subject of social media. The skills learned by attending the training were instrumental in developing a successful strategy for the City's Facebook, Instagram and Twitter presence.

iv. **Goal/Objective 3:** Partner with the Redlands Healthy Living Program by supporting the Redlands Healthy Living Summer Camp program by contributing funding to a nutritious, healthy lunch and snack with products partially sourced from the Redlands Farmers' Markets.

a. Progress Made: The Redlands Healthy Living Summer Camp program made some operational changes subsequent to the City receiving the FMPP grant when the City was able to secure other grant funding for the daily lunch and snacks component. The City tried to coordinate with the County contract meal provider in an effort to facilitate some of their purchases from the Redlands Farmers' Market and/or directly from its participating farmers. However, due to the multi-city coverage of their program, it was not possible to isolate some of their purchases just for Redlands. As an alternative to this program, the City worked with AMS staff to re-program funds to its existing cooking demonstration budget and implemented more youth activities at the Saturday Morning Market in an effort to continue to reach the local youth.

b. Impact on Community: The cooking demonstrations, particularly those that were held at the Redlands Community Center during busy sporting events were very well attended by local youth.

2. **Quantify the overall impact of the project on the intended beneficiaries, if applicable, from the baseline date (the start of the award performance period, September 30, 2014). Include further explanation if necessary.**

- i. **Number of direct jobs created:** One new part-time job was created during the term of the grant.
- ii. **Number of jobs retained:** N/A
- iii. **Number of indirect jobs created:** One in-direct job was created when a new farmer added a part-time person to work their stall at the Saturday Morning Market.
- iv. **Number of markets expanded:** Two existing farmers' markets were expanded.
- v. **Number of new markets established:** N/A
- vi. **Market sales increased by \$7,842 and increased by 11%** (Based upon City revenue which is calculated at 8% of farmers gross sales for the Saturday Morning Farmers' Market and Thursday Night Farmers' Markets combined when comparing the first 12 months of the FMPP grant to the last 12 months of the FMPP grant term.) EBT sales increased from approximately 3% of total sales to 12% of total sales for the same periods used above.
- vii. **Number of farmers/producers that have benefited from the project:** 35

a. Percent Increase: Over the two year term of the FMPP grant, five (5) new farmers were added to the Markets resulting in a 12% increase in the overall size of the City's Markets. While additional growth was possible due to new farmer interest and desire to participate, physical space limitations prevented even further growth at this time. Staff has begun looking for ways to logistically expand the areas used for farmers' stalls in order to continue to grow both markets.

3. Did you expand your customer base by reaching new populations such as new ethnic groups, additional low income/low access populations, new businesses, etc.? If so, how?

Yes. As a result of receiving the FMPP grant, the City was able to conduct actual "advertising" activities for the first time in many years. City staff worked closely with a local radio station to develop a multi-faceted radio, email and Facebook advertising campaign that targeted low- to moderate- income people. Surveys were conducted at the Markets with customers using the EBT/SNAP program as they purchased their script utilizing the iPad that was purchased with the FMPP grant funds. The survey results during the period of time of the 90 day campaign period indicated the following:

- 75% of EBT customers were residents from outside of the City of Redlands
- 20% were 1st time visitors to the Redlands Farmers' Markets
- The primary means of knowing that the Redlands Farmers' Market accepted EBT benefits was by seeing a sign at the farmer's booths
- 10% heard about the Redlands Farmers' Market and its acceptance of EBT benefits from the radio advertisement
- Average EBT Sale per customer, per event, was \$18.95

Survey results taken six (6) months after the advertising campaign had concluded indicated the following:

- 64% of EBT customers were residents from outside of the City of Redlands
- 16% were 1st time visitors to the Redlands Farmers' Markets
- The primary means of knowing that the Redlands Farmers' Market accepted EBT benefits other than by being a previous customer, was by seeing a posting on the City's website or its other social media platforms
- Average EBT Sale per customer, per event, increased to \$23.90 or 20% higher over the previous survey period

The City also realized a 3% increase in EBT customers who found out about its EBT/SNAP program by either Facebook, Twitter, Instagram posting.

4. Discuss your community partnerships.

- i. Who are your community partners?** The City of Redlands' Quality of Life's Recreation Division was a primary partner with the Development Services/Downtown Division as it related to the FMPP grant.
- ii. How have they contributed to the overall results of the FMPP project?** The Recreation Division hosted FMPP grant funded cooking demonstrations at the Community Center

during busy sporting events that were targeted to youth and healthy snacking alternatives. The majority of the ingredients used during the demonstrations were from the City's farmers' markets. Additionally, the Recreation Division facilitated shuttle rides from the Community Center to the Saturday Morning Farmers' Market during the Cooking Demonstrations/sporting events.

- iii. **How will they continue to contribute to your project's future activities, beyond the performance period of this FMPP grant?** The Recreation Division will continue to distribute vouchers to qualifying seniors for \$10 worth of food purchases with encouragement that they use their voucher at the City's farmers' markets.

5. **Are you using contractors to conduct the work? If so, how did their work contribute to the results of the FMPP project?** During the term of the FMPP grant the City worked with the County of San Bernardino Department of Public Health - Healthy Communities and Nutrition Program and graduate students from the Public Health Department of Loma Linda University to conduct an assessment of both the Thursday Night and Saturday Morning farmers' markets in August, 2016. The results of the assessment were recently published and have been included with this report. Some of the data is acknowledged to be skewed and there were some differences between surveys taken by City staff to directly track FMPP progress and this assessment. The total pool of survey participants was relatively small and is believed to not be completely representative of the normal customer mix resulting in some of the skewed data. However, in general the assessment confirmed several facts that were also discovered during the term of the FMPP grant. Consistency and regularity in marketing and advertising is critical; more vendors and more variety in selections is desired; increasing awareness through social media, and additional partnering with WIC/SNAP in the future will support increased access to locally grown, affordable and nutritious food, particularly to youth, seniors and low- to moderate-income residents in underserved areas.

6. **Have you publicized any results yet?*** Yes.

- i. **If yes, how did you publicize the results?**

Annually the City prepares a written report titled the Business Year In Review for the City Council. Among other accomplishments realized by the department, the report includes updates and accomplishments specifically related to the FMPP Grant activities. This report is also made available to the community through a posting on the City's website. See the 2015 Business Year in Review (page 9) attachment to this report. The 2016 Business Year in Review report has not been prepared as of the date this report was prepared, but will once again include accomplishments achieved with the FMPP grant award when it is prepared during the first quarter of 2017.

Additionally, all advertising collateral and press releases for FMPP funded events and activities included acknowledgement of the USDA's FMPP award. Examples are included with this report.

- ii. **To whom did you publicize the results?**

The Business Year In Review was prepared for the Redlands City Council and the general public and was posted on the City's website and available as a counter handout.

Press Releases are distributed to all local newspapers and radio stations, as well as being posted on the City's website and global social media sites all with varying followers.

- iii. **How many stakeholders (i.e. people, entities) did you reach?** The City's web page for the 2015 Business Year In Review report was viewed 9,696 times.

***Send any publicity information (brochures, announcements, newsletters, etc.) electronically along with this report. Non-electronic promotional items should be digitally photographed and emailed with this report (do not send the actual item).**

7. Have you collected any feedback from your community and additional stakeholders about your work?

i. If so, how did you collect the information?

Surveys were taken from farmer's participating in the Redlands Farmers' Markets. Additionally, participants at various cooking demonstrations and other events were surveyed.

ii. What feedback was relayed (specific comments)?

FARMER SURVEY:

50% AGREED and 25% STRONGLY AGREED that there was a noticeable increase in traffic at the Market's during the past two years.

30% AGREED that promotional efforts by the City increased traffic at the Market's during the past two years.

55% AGREED and 10% STRONGLY AGREED that there was a noticeable improvement in average sales during the past two years.

35% AGREED and 20% STRONGLY AGREED that by accepting SNAP/EBT at the Thursday Night Farmers' Market sales have increased during the past two years.

60% AGREED and 25% STRONGLY AGREED that there has been a noticeable improvement in customer diversity at the Market's during the past two years.

8. Budget Summary:

- i. **As part of the FMPP closeout procedures, you are required to submit the SF-425 (Final Federal Financial Report). Check here if you have completed the SF-425 and are submitting it with this report:**

- ii. **Did the project generate any income? No.**

a. If yes, how much was generated and how was it used to further the objectives of the award?

9. Lessons Learned:

- i. **Summarize any lessons learned. They should draw on positive experiences (e.g. good ideas that improved project efficiency or saved money) and negative experiences (e.g. what did not go well and what needs to be changed).**

One of the biggest challenges the City faced during the term of the FMPP grant was maintaining long-term staffing stability of the part-time Market Assistant position. Two different people filled the position during the term of the grant. However, the position was vacant for a variety of reasons (recruitment process, etc.) for approximately 30% of the grant term which prevented us from 1.) Expending approximately \$7,075 of the salary budget line item, and 2.) Completing all of the goals and

objectives outlined in the initial application, including successfully expending all of the grant award. In retrospect, a full-time Market Assistant position that would hopefully attract a more stable applicant pool would be definitely considered.

During the term of the FMPP grant, the City re-programmed funds to facilitate social media ads and Facebook posting boosts. These paid boosts were instrumental to reaching a larger, targeted demographic which ultimately led to increased followers, who became visitors to the markets. Another lesson learned is that we would have increased the amount of funds allocated to advertising. The City's farmers' markets have not had any advertising budget for the past several years due to budget cuts, and while some funding for advertising was included in the FMPP grant, doubling or tripling that budget would have helped us reach our goals much more quickly.

ii. If goals or outcome measures were not achieved, identify and share the lessons learned to help others expedite problem-solving:

Hiring a full-time Market Assistant as opposed to a part-time Market Assistant could have provided for increased employment stability.

iii. Describe any lessons learned in the administration of the project that might be helpful for others who would want to implement a similar project:

In the future the City would seriously consider requiring stronger analytical skills for the Market Assistant position. Recordkeeping, data analysis, trend analysis, etc. are all critical in determining the success or failure of an activity and would be a value-added skill necessary to the administration requirements. This would require a higher salary, but the benefits would be significant.

It was with great disappointment that the Shuttle Service was not successful. The original research indicated there was significant interest in a free service that would bring residents directly to the Saturday Farmers' Market each week. After cancelling the program due to a lack of ridership, additional research indicated that the target demographic would either prefer the creation of a new farmers' market in their local neighborhood, potentially in walking distance of their residence, or a delivery service, as opposed to traveling from one side of town to the other to attend the existing market.

10. Future Work:

- i. How will you continue the work of this project beyond the performance period? In other words, how will you parlay the results of your project's work to benefit future community goals and initiatives? Include information about community impact and outreach, anticipated increases in markets and/or sales, estimated number of jobs retained/created, and any other information you'd like to share about the future of your project.**

The City continues to accept EBT/SNAP benefits at both of its farmers' markets and continues to see week to week increases in the numbers of customers coming to the markets specifically to use their EBT benefits as well as a slow, but steady increase in sales. The Redlands City Council remains committed to its Healthy Living initiatives and programs, including on-going support of the farmers' markets. Thanks to the FMPP grant, the extensive groundwork was successfully completed with regards to developing a

strong internet and social media presence that allows the City to promote and advertise its Farmers' Markets at little to no expense other than staff time devoted to postings.

The City has also been able to drive tremendous traffic to its enhanced website thanks to receiving the FMPP Grant. The enhanced website has alleviated staff from spending a significant amount of time responding to telephone calls each week and allowed them to focus on program and activity development, delivery and administration. The exposure provided to the farmers' through the "Farmer Profiles" indicates that over 1,618 people viewed the Thursday Night Market Farmer Profiles and 2,296 people viewed the Saturday Morning Market Farmer Profiles during the term of the FMPP grant. A sample Farmer Profile is included with this report.

ii. Do you have any recommendations for future activities and, if applicable, an outline of next steps or additional research that might advance the project goals?

While the City is aware that there are other grants specifically for this purpose, it remains clear that being able to provide a dollar match or cash incentive to EBT customers would provide as much, if not more, benefit as cooking demonstrations or promotional give-away's (measuring cups, shopping bags etc.) which can be time-consuming. While they were well received by the public, a cash incentive has the potential to provide a quicker and easier impact when reaching out to new customers. The City plans to pursue all grant opportunities that can provide EBT matching funds in the future.